Using Cumulative Risk Assessment in a Community Setting

ORD Science Topic Workshop on Cumulative Risk Assessment Dallas November, 2002

CRA and Community Concerns

- CRA overlaps with community questions and concerns in some, but not all areas
- Both the value and limitations of CRA must be clearly understood and explained for effective use

Community Concerns

- What is causing our poor health?
- Is there something in the environment that is affecting, or may affect, our community's health?
- What can we do to improve our environment and our community health?
- What are the risks and sources that we should be most concerned about?
- Is a particular source affecting our health?
- Is it safe to site any new sources in our community?
- Do we have an unfair share of environmental risk?











Types of Risk Assessment

- Total risk assessment: all risks affecting community integrated
- Cumulative risk assessment: environmental stressors, a subset of total risk
 - CRA for <u>all</u> environmental stressors (ambient air including toxics, biologicals, dust; dietary and drinking water exposures, lead and asbestos, soil, noise, smell, etc.)
 - CRA for <u>subset</u> of environmental stressors, e.g., all air sources, or diet and drinking water, or pesticide exposures, or industrial and commercial sources, etc.

Explaining CRA Limitations

- Environmental stressors only one of many factors affecting community health
- Community needs comprehensive analysis of all factors for most effective planning
 - Access to health care; diet and lifestyle such as smoking, nutrition, and stress; occupational exposures; accidents, etc.

Explaining Limitations (continued)

- CRA cannot provide information on cause of current illnesses in community
- CRA a tool primarily used to reduce risks and exposures with goal of improving community health in the future
- Because community health is affected by multiple factors, using CRA <u>alone</u> with a community interested in improving community health is a recipe for disappointment

Explaining CRA's Value

- Can provide crucial information to community interested in finding more effective ways to improve community health
- Can help to build the community consensus needed to mobilize to improve community health
- Can provide information for comparing risks among different communities

Approaches to Community CRA

- CRA done independently: requires effort to integrate into overall community concerns
- CRA done as part of broader community health assessment effort: Ideal approach for national Healthy People 2010 Initiative
- CRA used to compare risks among communities:
 - Requires standardization of methods
 - Produces important information for targeting, siting, and fairness issues. MATESII, RSEI as examples.

Community Goal: Risk Reduction

- Information provided by CRA only a means to reach community's real end: risk reduction
- Valuable and effective tool for targeting limited resources, but only tool, not end
- Design CRA to support risk reduction goal:
 - Begin with immediate action on low hanging fruits
 - Include risk reduction phase in planning
 - Partners needed for risk reduction participate in CRA

CRA Emphasizes:

Work in Voluntary Settings

- Given limits of current statutes, CRA will often have to rely on voluntary initiatives for both analysis and risk reduction
- Understand conditions for successful voluntary effort: local community united and mobilized to reduce risks
- Design CRA process with the goal of a mobilized community in mind:
 - Involve all stakeholders in a deliberative process that builds consensus
 - Use CRA process to build consensus and capacity in community: CRA as an educational tool or process

CRA Emphasizes:

Work with Partnerships

- Emphasis on partnerships necessary:
 - To have sufficient resources to do CRA
 - To have sufficient resources for risk reduction
 - To address non-environmental factors affecting community health
- Partnerships needed within EPA, among federal agencies, with public health community

CRA Emphasizes:

Understanding Community Context

- Environmental issues not isolated in communities
- CRA work needs to be aware of overall community concerns and priorities: jobs, development, crime
- Do work in a way that supports and reinforces other community priorities

Obstacles to Expect

- Some will find new CRA information difficult to accept
- Partnership approach runs counter to normal way of doing business
- Turf battles among federal, state, and local governments
- Communities expect government to provide answers and solve problems, not act as partner
- General uneasiness with uncertainty and changes in science

Overcoming Obstacles

- Only long-term good faith efforts working with communities will demonstrate the value of CRA and partnership with EPA
- Good news: Willing community partner organizations exist and already working in Community Based Research partnerships
 - WHEACT in Harlem, Community Action Against
 Asthma in Detroit, West Jefferson County Taskforce in
 Louisville, Community Air Project in St.Louis, etc.

What's Needed to Move Forward?

We need more experience and research:

- Practical guidance and tools for using CRA in community setting
- Pilots designed to gain experience and to develop guidance and tools
- Research to support community CRA:
 - Natural Sciences: inventory, modeling and monitoring studies
 - Social Sciences: Partnership, risk communication, mobilization

OPPT Work in Progress

- Completion and peer review of Community Air Screening How To Manual
- Development of web based modeling accessible to communities: IGEMS
- Partnership for development of high school curriculum materials based on IGEMS and How To Manual

What's Needed (continued):

- Stronger coordination in Agency to improve communication and pool limited resources
- National coordination and leadership role:
 - Promote good communication to foster learning across states: Newsletters, conferences, etc.
 - Establish a division of labor to share research and tool development
 - Summarize experiences, identify best practices, and set standards

Conclusion:

- Just beginning to learn how to use CRA to help communities address their concerns
- CRA presents a great opportunity for EPA to learn how to work with and empower communities to effectively improve their health and environments

Contact and Reference Information

OPPT Contacts:

Hank Topper, topper.henry @epa.gov 202-564-8534 Dave Lynch, lynch.david@epa.gov 202-564-8532

Baltimore Case Study:

http://www.epa.gov/opptintr/cahp/case.html

Internet Geographical Exposure Modeling System

http://www.epa.gov/oppt/exposure/docs/gems.htm

Local Air Toxics Assessment Workshop:

http://www.epa.gov/ttn/atw/wks/mainwks.html

California Neighborhood Assessment Program

http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/programs/nap/nap.htm